

Stanford Law Review

© 2005 by the Board of Trustees of the
Leland Stanford Junior University

October 2005

CONTENTS

A MORE PERFECT SYSTEM: TWENTY-FIVE YEARS OF GUIDELINES SENTENCING REFORM

INTRODUCTION

SENTENCING LESSONS	1
<i>Robert Weisberg & Marc L. Miller</i>	

PURPOSES

THE FUNCTIONS OF SENTENCING AND SENTENCING REFORM	37
<i>Michael Tonry</i>	
PUNISHMENT PURPOSES.....	67
<i>Richard S. Frase</i>	
DISPARITY: THE NORMATIVE AND EMPIRICAL FAILURE OF THE FEDERAL GUIDELINES	85
<i>Albert W. Alschuler</i>	

FEDERALISM

OUR FEDERAL SYSTEM OF SENTENCING.....	119
<i>Rachel E. Barkow</i>	
REGULATING LOCAL VARIATIONS IN FEDERAL SENTENCING.....	137
<i>Stephanos Bibas</i>	

STRUCTURE

THE ENFORCEABILITY OF SENTENCING GUIDELINES	155
<i>Kevin R. Reitz</i>	
GUIDANCE FROM ABOVE AND BEYOND.....	175
<i>Steven L. Chanenson</i>	

INSTITUTIONS

FROM <i>WINSHIP</i> TO <i>APPRENDI</i> TO <i>BOOKER</i> : CONSTITUTIONAL COMMAND OR CONSTITUTIONAL BLUNDER?	195
<i>Ronald J. Allen & Ethan A. Hastert</i>	
A SECOND CHANCE FOR SENTENCING REFORM: ESTABLISHING A SENTENCING AGENCY IN THE JUDICIAL BRANCH	217
<i>Kate Stith & Karen Dunn</i>	
MR. MADISON MEETS A TIME MACHINE: THE POLITICAL SCIENCE OF FEDERAL SENTENCING REFORM	235
<i>Frank O. Bowman, III</i>	

CONTENT

REFORMING THE FEDERAL SENTENCING GUIDELINES' MISGUIDED APPROACH TO REAL-OFFENSE SENTENCING.....	267
<i>David Yellen</i>	
DISTINGUISHING OFFENSE CONDUCT AND OFFENDER CHARACTERISTICS IN MODERN SENTENCING REFORMS	277
<i>Douglas A. Berman</i>	

COUNSEL

JUDICIAL OVERSIGHT OF NEGOTIATED SENTENCES IN A WORLD OF BARGAINED PUNISHMENT	293
<i>Nancy J. King</i>	
PARITY, DISPARITY, AND ADVERSARIALITY: FIRST PRINCIPLES OF SENTENCING.....	309
<i>Margareth Etienne</i>	

SANCTIONS

PENAL POLICY AND PENAL LEGISLATION IN RECENT AMERICAN EXPERIENCE.....	323
<i>Franklin E. Zimring</i>	
SMART PUBLIC POLICY: REPLACING IMPRISONMENT WITH TARGETED NONPRISON SENTENCES AND COLLATERAL SANCTIONS.....	339
<i>Nora V. Demleitner</i>	

KNOWLEDGE

"THE WISDOM WE HAVE LOST": SENTENCING INFORMATION AND ITS USES	361
<i>Marc L. Miller & Ronald F. Wright</i>	

EDITORIAL BOARD

VOLUME 58

JOSHUA L. KAUL
President

KARI ROSENTHAL ANNAND CHRISTOPHER J. WALKER
Managing Editors

NATHANIEL GARRETT
Senior Note Editor

MICHELLE SKINNER
Senior Symposium Editor

RACHEL KOVNER
Senior Article Editor

TONY LOPEZ
Senior Book Review Editor

APARNA SRIDHAR
Senior Development Editor

TREVOR DRYER
Senior Finance Editor

Executive Editors

Note Editors
JAMES ADLER
MONICA FOLCH
MALI FRIEDMAN
NANCY LEONG

SARA CAMES
CAROLYN JACOBS CHACHKIN
BENJAMIN DIGGS
ALEXANDER JONGHEE HAN
ROBERT HUNT
RENA KAMINSKY
DAVID LIEBERMAN
JOHN NJOKU
JEYA PAUL
DAVID C. RYBICKI
RYAN SCOVILLE
CASSANDRA SETO
JESSICA WOLLAND

Article Editors
JAMES DARROW
CHANTALE FIEBIG
QUENTIN KOFFEY
LAUREN KOFKE
ALEX LEES
CAROL LI
PETE PATTERSON
WILLIAM RIDGWAY

Book Review Editors
JEFF HAYES
STEFANIE SCHNEIDER

Symposium Editors
KEVIN CLUNE
ARON GOETZL
HEATHER MITCHELL
MEGAN NELSON
LISA SALTZBURG

Development Editors
YVONNE GARCIA
OMAR NAZIF

Librarian
JONATHAN TANNER

Associate Managing Editors
IAN CRICHTON
DAVID PRICE

Finance Editor
MIKE MONGAN

CLARK ASAY
ERICA BLACHMAN
SEBASTIAN CHAN
SOO-JEAN CHI
MORGIA DAMPF
LAURIE DEAN
MATTHEW FOX
LISA FREEMAN
CHERYL GALVIN
SARAH GILBERT
AARON GRÜBER
HENRY HUANG
DAVID JANG
KATHRYN C. JOHNSON
JAMESON REECE JONES
MICHAEL KAUFMAN

Members
IAN KELLOGG
ESTHER H. KIM
DANIEL KORN
CATHERINE LEBLOND
HILARY GAUDIANI LEY
MIRIAM LIEBERMAN
CARA ANN MARR
AIDAN MCGLAZE
KIMBERLEY MORRIS
DAVID MOSKOWITZ
OSAHON OMOREGIE
JOHN PARTRIDGE
ELIZABETH PEDERSON
JULIA SCHIEFFELIN POWELL
LINDSEY POWELL
ADAM REGOLI

JOE EDELHEIT ROSS
ARIEL R. SCHWARTZ
ARIEL SIMON
CHRISTOPHER J. SMITH
JULIE SMOLINSKI
JONATHAN STEIN
RENEE STOWITZKY
DAVID STRANDNESS
TINA TONG
FRANCESCO VALENTINI
MELANIE WACHTELL
GREGG WEBB
BRIAN WOLFE
RAE WOODS
ERIK ZIMMERMAN
JOSEPH ZIZZO

Business Manager
BLANCA NUNEZ

Information About the *Stanford Law Review*

Subscriptions: The *Stanford Law Review* (ISSN 0038-9765) is published six times a year (October, November, December, February, March, and April) by students of the Stanford Law School, Crown Quadrangle, Stanford, California 94305-8610. Subscriptions are \$42 per year; for postage to a foreign address, add \$5. All subscriptions are for the volume year and will be renewed automatically unless the subscriber provides timely notice of cancellation.

Postage: Periodicals postage paid at Palo Alto, California 94303, and additional mailing offices.

Postmaster: Mail change of address or other subscription information to Business Manager, *Stanford Law Review*, Crown Quadrangle, Stanford, California 94305-8610. Include name, new address (including zip code), and old address or mailing label. Please mail changes at least six to eight weeks before publication date to ensure prompt delivery. The U.S. Postal Service will not forward copies unless additional postage is paid by the subscriber.

Single Issues: Issues in the current volume are available from the *Review* for \$14 each. For back issues, volumes, and sets, inquire of William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209.

Manuscripts: The *Review* accepts the submission of unsolicited manuscripts over the internet. For instructions, please see <http://lawreview.stanford.edu/articles>. Although not preferred, submissions by mail are also accepted. Please include an e-mail address with all submissions.

Citations: The text and citations of the *Review* generally conform to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (18th ed. 2005), copyright by The Columbia Law Review Association, The Harvard Law Review Association, the *University of Pennsylvania Law Review*, and *The Yale Law Journal*.

Internet Address: The *Stanford Law Review* homepage is located at <http://lawreview.stanford.edu>.

The Stanford University School of Law

OFFICERS OF ADMINISTRATION

John Hennessy, B.E., M.S., Ph.D., President of the University
John Etchemendy, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Provost of the University
Larry D. Kramer, A.B., J.D., Dean and Richard E. Lang Professor of Law
Mark G. Kelman, A.B., J.D., Vice Dean and William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law
G. Marcus Cole, B.S., J.D., Professor of Law, Helen L. Crocker Faculty Scholar, and Associate Dean for Curriculum
Pamela S. Karlan, B.A., M.A., J.D., Kenneth and Harle Montgomery Professor of Public Interest Law, and Associate Dean for Research and Academics
Lawrence C. Marshall, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law, David and Stephanie Mills Director of Clinical Education, and Associate Dean for Public Interest and Clinical Education
Frank F. Brucato, B.A., Senior Associate Dean for Finance and Chief Financial Officer
Faye Deal, A.B., Associate Dean for Admissions and Financial Aid
Catherine Glaze, A.B., J.D., Associate Dean for Student Affairs
Susan Robinson, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Career Services
Catherine Nardone, B.S., Associate Dean for External Relations

FACULTY EMERITI

Barbara Allen Babcock, A.B., LL.B., LL.D. (hon.), Judge John Crown Professor of Law, Emerita
John H. Barton, B.S., J.D., George E. Osborne Professor of Law, Emeritus
Paul Brest, A.B., LL.B., LL.D. (hon.), Professor of Law, Emeritus
William Cohen, B.A., LL.B., C. Wendell and Edith M. Carlsmith Professor of Law, Emeritus
Lance E. Dickson, B.A., LL.B., B.Com., M.L.S., Professor of Law, Emeritus, and former Director of Robert Crown Law Library
Marc A. Franklin, A.B., LL.B., Frederick I. Richman Professor of Law, Emeritus
William B. Gould IV, A.B., LL.B., Charles A. Beardsley Professor of Law, Emeritus
John Henry Merryman, B.S., M.S., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D., Dr. h.c., Nelson Bowman Sweitzer and Marie B. Sweitzer Professor of Law, Emeritus, and Affiliated Professor, Department of Art, Emeritus
David Rosenhan, A.B., M.A., Ph.D., Professor of Law and Psychology, Emeritus
Kenneth E. Scott, A.B., M.A., LL.B., Ralph M. Parsons Professor of Law and Business, Emeritus
Howard R. Williams, A.B., LL.B., Robert E. Paradise Professor of Natural Resources Law, Emeritus

PROFESSORS

Janet Cooper Alexander, B.A., M.A., J.D., Frederick I. Richman Professor of Law
Joseph M. Bankman, A.B., J.D., Ralph M. Parsons Professor of Law and Business
R. Richard Banks, B.A., M.A., J.D., Professor of Law and Justin M. Roach, Jr. Faculty Scholar
Gerhard Casper, Referendar, LL.M., Dr. iur. utr., LL.D. (hon.), President Emeritus and Peter and Helen Bing Professor in Undergraduate Education, Professor of Law, Senior Fellow, Institute for International Studies, and Professor by courtesy of Political Science
G. Marcus Cole, B.S., J.D., Professor of Law, Helen L. Crocker Faculty Scholar, and Associate Dean for Curriculum
Richard Craswell, B.A., J.D., William F. Baxter-Visa International Professor of Law
Mariano-Florentino Cuéllar, A.B., A.M., J.D., Ph.D., Associate Professor of Law and Deane F. Johnson Faculty Scholar
Robert M. Daines, B.S., B.A., J.D., Pritzker Professor of Law and Business
Michele Landis Dauber, B.S.W., J.D., Ph.D., Associate Professor of Law and Bernard D. Bergreen Faculty Scholar
George Fisher, A.B., J.D., Judge John Crown Professor of Law
Richard Thompson Ford, A.B., J.D., George E. Osborne Professor of Law
Barbara H. Fried, B.A., M.A., J.D., William W. and Gertrude H. Saunders Professor of Law
Lawrence M. Friedman, A.B., J.D., LL.M., LL.D. (hon.), Marion Rice Kirkwood Professor of Law and Professor by courtesy of Political Science
Ronald J. Gilson, A.B., J.D., Charles J. Meyers Professor of Law and Business
Paul Goldstein, A.B., LL.B., Stella W. and Ira S. Lillick Professor of Law
Henry T. Greely, A.B., J.D., Deane F. and Kate Edelman Johnson Professor of Law, Professor by courtesy of Genetics
Thomas C. Grey, A.B., B.A., LL.B., Nelson Bowman Sweitzer and Marie B. Sweitzer Professor of Law
Joseph A. Grundfest, B.A., M.Sc., J.D., W.A. Franke Professor of Law and Business
Thomas C. Heller, A.B., LL.B., Lewis Talbot and Nadine Hearn Shelton Professor of International Legal Studies
Deborah R. Hensler, A.B., Ph.D., Judge John W. Ford Professor of Dispute Resolution
Pamela S. Karlan, B.A., M.A., J.D., Kenneth and Harle Montgomery Professor of Public Interest Law, and Associate Dean for Research and Academics
Mark G. Kelman, A.B., J.D., Vice Dean and William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law
Amalia D. Kessler, A.B., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., Assistant Professor of Law
Daniel P. Kessler, A.B., J.D., Ph.D., Professor of Economics, Law, and Policy, Graduate School of Business; Hoover Institution Senior Fellow; Professor (by courtesy) of Law
Michael Klausner, B.A., M.A., J.D., Nancy and Charles Munger Professor of Business and Professor of Law
William Koski, B.B.A., J.D., Ph.D., Professor of Law (Teaching)
Larry D. Kramer, A.B., J.D., Dean and Richard E. Lang Professor of Law
Mark A. Lemley, B.A., J.D., William H. Neukom Professor of Law
Lawrence Lessig, B.A., B.S., M.A., J.D., C. Wendell and Edith M. Carlsmith Professor of Law

Lawrence C. Marshall, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law, David and Stephanie Mills Director of Clinical Education, and Associate Dean for Public Interest and Clinical Education
 Jenny S. Martinez, B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law
 Miguel A. Méndez, A.A., A.B., J.D., Adelbert H. Sweet Professor of Law
 Alison D. Morantz, A.B., M.Sc., J.D., Ph.D., Assistant Professor of Law
 A. Mitchell Polinsky, A.B., Ph.D., M.S.L., Josephine Scott Crocker Professor of Law and Economics and Professor by courtesy of Economics
 Robert L. Rabin, B.S., J.D., Ph.D., A. Calder Mackay Professor of Law
 Margaret Jane Radin, A.B., M.F.A., J.D., LL.D. (hon.), Wm. Benjamin Scott and Luna M. Scott Professor of Law
 Deborah L. Rhode, B.A., J.D., Ernest W. McFarland Professor of Law
 Norman W. Spaulding, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law and John A. Wilson Distinguished Faculty Scholar
 Jayashri Srikantiah, B.S., J.D., Associate Professor of Law (Teaching)
 Jeff Strnad, A.B., J.D., Ph.D., Charles A. Beardsley Professor of Law
 Kathleen M. Sullivan, B.A., B.A., J.D., Stanley Morrison Professor of Law and former Dean
 Barton H. Thompson, Jr., A.B., J.D., M.B.A., Robert E. Paradise Professor of Natural Resources Law and Director, Stanford Institute for the Environment
 Michael S. Wald, A.B., M.A., LL.B., Jackson Eli Reynolds Professor of Law
 Allen S. Weiner, A.B., J.D., Associate Professor of Law (Teaching) and Warren Christopher Professor of the Practice of International Law and Diplomacy
 Robert Weisberg, A.B., A.M., Ph.D., J.D., Edwin E. Huddleson, Jr. Professor of Law

SENIOR LECTURERS

Margaret Caldwell, B.S., J.D., Director, Environmental and Natural Resources Law and Policy Program, and Senior Lecturer, Stanford Institute for the Environment
 Janet Martinez, B.S., J.D., M.P.A.
 David W. Mills, B.A., J.D.
 Alan B. Morrison, B.A., LL.B.
 Helen Stacy, LL.B., G.D.L.P., Ph.D.

VISITING PROFESSORS & AFFILIATED FACULTY

Alexandria Boehm, B.S., M.S., Ph.D., Affiliated Faculty
 Juliet Brodie, A.B., J.D., Visiting Associate Professor of Law
 Christopher L. Kutz, B.A., Ph.D., J.D., Richard and Frances Mallery Visiting Professor of Law
 David J. Luban, B.A., M.A., M.Phil., Ph.D., Leah Kaplan Visiting Professor of Human Rights
 Nathaniel Persily, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law
 Joan Petersilia, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law
 Paul C. Pfleiderer, B.A., M.Phil., Ph.D., Affiliated Faculty
 Madhav Ragan, B.Com., M.S., M.B.A., Ph.D., Affiliated Faculty
 Jane Schacter, A.B., J.D., Edwin A. Heafey, Jr. Visiting Professor of Law
 Alan O. Sykes, B.A., J.D., Ph.D., Herman Phleger Visiting Professor of Law
 Timothy Wu, B.Sc., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law

LECTURERS

J. Holmes Armstead, J.D., Ph.D.	Danielle Jones, B.A., J.D.	Lisa M. Pearson, B.A., J.D., J.S.M.
Simão J. Ávila, B.A., J.D.	Julie Matlof Kennedy, A.B., J.D.	Rogelio Pérez-Perdomo, J.D., LL.M., Ph.D.
Marilyn M. Bautista, B.A., J.D.	Suzanne A. Kim, B.A., J.D.	Joe W. Pitts, III, B.A., J.D.
Yar Chaikovsky, B.S., J.D.	Jason D. Kipnis, B.S., M.S., J.D.	Brian J.M. Quinn, B.S.F.S., M.P.P., J.D., M.L.S.
Michael Dickstein, A.B., J.D.	Suzanne McKechnie Klahr, B.A., B.S., J.D.	Peter H. Reid, A.B., J.D., LL.M.
Randee Fenner, A.B., J.D.	Jeffrey Kobrick, B.A., J.D.	Lawrence Rosen, B.A., J.D.
Eric M. Fink, B.A., M.Sc., J.D.	J. Paul Lomio, B.A., J.D., LL.M., M.L.I.S.	Stephen A. Rosenbaum, B.A., M.P.P., J.D.
Joseph Flies-Away, A.B., M.P.A., J.D.	John Lyons, B.A., J.D.	Richard P. Salgado, B.A., J.D.
Jeremy Fogel, A.B., J.D.	Amichai Magen, B.A., LL.M., J.S.M.	Deborah A. Sivas, A.B., M.S., J.D.
Edward Frueh, B.A., Ph.D., J.D.	Michael W. McConnell, B.A., J.D.	Stephanie E. Smith, B.A., J.D.
Thomas C. Goldstein, A.B., J.D.	Beth McLellan, A.B., J.D.	Margaret Stevenson, B.A., J.D.
Manuel A. Gomez, J.D., J.S.M.	Jeanne Merino, A.B., J.D.	Roland Vogl, Dr.iur., J.S.M., J.D.
Linda Grais, A.B., M.D., J.D.	Richard Morningstar, B.A., J.D.	Bruce Wagman, B.S., B.S.N., J.D.
Jennifer Stisa Granick, B.A., J.D.	Thomas J. Nolan, B.A., J.D.	Erika V. Wayne, A.B., J.D., M.S.
Jonathan D. Greenberg, B.A., J.D.	Jessica Notini, B.A., J.D.	Kathleen M. Wilko, B.A., J.D., M.L.S.
Tim Hallahan, A.B., J.D.	Ralph Pais, B.A., J.D.	Katherine Wright, B.A., J.D.
Brad Handler, B.A., B.S.E., J.D.	Lynette Parker, B.A., M.C.P., J.D.	
Amy Howe, A.B., M.A., J.D.	Eliza Patten, B.A., J.D.	
Grace Hum, B.A., J.D., J.S.M.	B. Howard Pearson, B.S., J.D.	
Erik Jensen, B.A., J.D., LL.M.		
David Johnson, A.B., J.D.		

PROFESSIONAL LIBRARY STAFF

Annie Chen, B.A., M.L.S.	Kathleen M. Wilko, B.A., J.D., M.L.S.
Julie Kane, B.A., M.S.L.I.S.	Erika V. Wayne, B.A., J.D., M.S.
J. Paul Lomio, B.A., J.D., LL.M., M.L.I.S.	Kathleen M. Winzer, B.A., M.L.S.
Regina T. Wallen, A.B., M.L.S.	Naheed Zaheer, B.Sc., M.Sc., M.L.I.S.